

Special Report

How Would You Like Your “A”?

A Look at What the Sawyer-Carter P&T Evaluations Say

As the 2007-08 P&T season’s dossiers circulate further into the corridors of the CoB, word is spreading about what former EFIB economist, Charles Sawyer, and current EFIB Chair, George Carter, are saying about the research credentials of two of the EFIB’s P&T candidates – Sami Dakhli and Akbar Marvasti. In both sets of evaluations – Sawyer’s “external review” of Marvasti, and Carter’s “independent, professional judgments” of both Dakhli and Marvasti – the duo of Sawyer and Carter attempt to make the case that most academics in economics never publish in an “A” journal. As such, Sawyer and Carter claim that by having 3 “As” and 2 “As,” respectively, Dakhli and Marvasti are truly unique characters on the academic landscape, at least among academic economists.



Charles Sawyer



George Carter



Sami Dakhli



Akbar Marvasti

In order to investigate the rarity of “A” publications in economics, our reporters visited the EFIB’s [faculty web pages](#). There we examined, among the publications listed for each individual, the inclusion of “A” journal publications (using the CoB’s “A” journal lists). Where this search failed to show an “A,” it was supplemented by other sources (e.g., SEDONA, etc.). Table 1 below lists EFIB economists as having either zero “A” journal publications or more than zero “A” journal publications.

Table 1
The Incidence of “A” Publications Among EFIB Economists
0 “As” >0 “As”

0 “As”	>0 “As”
Carter, George	Dakhli, Sami
Monchuk, Daniel	Green, Trellis
	Gunther, William
	Klinedinst, Mark
	Marvasti, Akbar
	Mixon, Franklin
	Niroomand, Farhang
	Nissan, Edward

As Table 1 above points out, only two of the EFIB's 10 economists *do not have* any "A" journal publications. That means that eight, or **80%** of the CoB's economists, *do have* an "A" journal publication.¹

How can having an "A" journal publication in economics be so rare when **80%** of USM's economists – economists at a Tier IV institution – have one (or more)? It's baffling, isn't it? Sources also tell USMNEWS.NET that economists who have recently departed the CoB – Sawyer, Melody Lo, and Sunny Wong – all have "A" journal publications. If they are included, then the "*do have* 'A'" percentage becomes **84.6%**. It seems all one has to do to see that having an "A" in economics is not rare is to look to USM's **80-85%**. In doing so, one can only conclude that it's time to stick a fork in the Sawyer-Carter (-Marvasti P&T gambit) argument – it's done!

¹ Among the two economists who *do not have* any "A" journal publications is Daniel Monchuk, an *untentured assistant professor* of economics who received his PhD just a few years ago. If he is omitted from consideration, then one would conclude that **89.9%** of the CoB's economists *have* an "A" journal publication.